प्रोडक्शन पूरा हो रहा है, इसमें कोई दिक्कत नहीं है । फिर भी जो माननीय सदस्य ने कहा है कि प्रोडक्शन का परसन्टेज कितना है, इसको मैं बता दूंगा ।

श्री भूपेन्द्र सिंह मान : मेरा सवाल हो गया है, लेकिन जवाब पूरा नहीं आया । लेकिन थे इसके साथ यह कहना चाहता हूं कि जो प्रोडक्शन पंजाब में होता है, उसका कितना परसन्टेज पंजाब में कंज्यूम होता है, इसके बारे में भी मंत्री जी बतायें ।

उपसभापति : वह बता देंगे आपको भी । Next question. The question is limited to Punjab and I am not going outside; otherwise we will be going to every State. The question is limited to Punjab only. The pointedness of the question cannot be diluted. Dr. Kotaiah, I am not permitted it Please take your seat. I am not perfitting it.

Next question No. 265.

गरीबी रेखा से नीचे जीवन यापन करने वाले व्यक्तियों को दर्शाने वाले आंकड़ों का प्रतिशत

*265. **श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज :**
डा० जितेन्द्र कुमार जैन :†

क्या योजना और कार्यक्रम कार्यान्वयन मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) क्या यह सच है कि सरकार के पास उपलब्ध नवीनतम सूचना के अनुसार देश में लगभग 30% जनता गरीबी की रेखा से नीचे जीवन यापन कर रही है ;

(ख) क्या यह भी सच है कि दो वर्षों पहले कार्यक्रम कार्यान्वयन मंत्रालय ने यह दावा किया था कि गरीबी की रेखा से नीचे जीवन यापन करने वालों की संख्या, जो 1984–95 में 36.900 थी, 1989–90 के अंत तक घटकर 25.6% हो गई थी ;

(ग) यदि हां,, तो योजना आयोग ने आठवीं पंचवर्षीय योजना के लिये गरीबी उन्मूलन की स्कीमों हेतु उक्त दो आंकड़ों से किस आंकड़े को आधार माना है ; और

(घ) उसके क्या कारण हैं ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTR YOF PLANNING AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF NON-CONVENTIONAL ENERGY SOURCES (SHRI SUKH RAM): (a) to (d) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

(a) to (d) It is a fact that the number of people living below the poverty line in the country in 1987-88 was uearly 30 per cent of the otal population according to the latest available information i.e. for 1987-88. Information for the period after 1987-88 is not yet available.

The Ministry of programme Implementation had stated in their Annual Report for 1989-90 that the Seventh Plan envisaged a reduction of poverty ratio from 36.9 per cent of the total population as on 1st April, 1985 to 25.8 per cent by the end of the plan period i.e. 1989-90. But this 25.8 per cent was the target to be achieved by 1989-90. Whether this was actually achieved cannot be known until we have got the required information for the year 1989-90. As already stated above, the figure of around 30 per cent of the population below poverty line, as estamated by the Planning Commission, relates to the year 1987-88 and this is the latest year for which the figures are available. The Ministry of Programme Implementation do not make any estimate of people below the poverty line. It is the Planning Commission which makes such estimate. There is no contradiction between the two figures, as one relates to the target to be achieved by 1989-90 and the other relates to the actual figure of the people below the poverty line in 1987-88.

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN: Madam. in reply to my uestion, the hon.

†सभा में यह प्रश्न डा० जितेन्द्र कुमार पूछा गया ।

[Dr. Jitendra Kumar Jain]

Minister has admitted that a substantial percentage of our population is living below the poverty line. I would like to know, what has been the impact of the new economic policy on the people living below the poverty line and on the people just on the margin? The Finance Minister had also admitted that the new economic policy would result in increased unemployment. Moverover, the poor are facing more hardship now. My concern is that consequent upon the Government's action...

उपसभापति : आप सवाल पूछिए। अपना कमन मत बताइए।

You only put your question.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: His subject is mandir. How can he speak on economics?

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN: The new economic policy of the Government has increased the hardship of the people living below the poverty line. May I know is about the impact of this policy on this segment of the population and what Government proposes to do to mitigate the sufferings of the people who are facing more hardship now as a result of this policy? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, a number of steps have been taken by the Government of India in this regard, through the poverty alleviation programmes. The hon. Members are aware of these programmes. Now, in order to reduce the poverty and inequalities in the country, in the Eight Plan, which was recently approved by the National Development Council, Rs. 30,000 crores have been provided for the rural sector, i.e. the share of the Government of India is 80 per cent. To this, the share of the States, 20 per cent, will be added. This will come to around Rs. 40,000 crores, in the Eighth Five-Year Plan. The hon. Member himself could judge from this as to how much the programmes will be accelerated and what are the steps proposed by the Government, in the Eight Five-Years Plan, to reduce the poverty and inequalities in the country.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Second supplementary.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : यह दूसरा सप्लीमेंटरी कैसे पूछ सकते हैं (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति : उन्होंने ही सवाल पूछा है। सुषमा स्वराज जी ने ही पूछा है।

He is entitled, to two Supplementaries.

श्री शंकर दयाल सिंह : आपकी रूलिंग क्या है ताकि भविष्य में... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति : मेरी रूलिंग यही है——

He can ask a second supplementary.

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN: Madam, most of the people living below the poverty line are in the rural sector. In recent years, they have been further affected by drought and floods.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: How do you know that?

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTOM: He has made a survey.

उपसभापति : बोलने दीजिये। मंत्री को भी नहीं बोलने देते (**व्यवधान**)

एक माननीय सदस्य क्या वह जानें प्राब्लम क्या है (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति : उनको मालूमात होगी (**व्यवधान**)

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN: I pity the ignorance of the hon. Member. He should know that I belong to a village and I have worked in rural development projects. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jadhav, please sit down. I will not permit. This is Question Hour. Please do not interrupt. You are making a mockery of the Question Hour. I will not permit डाक्टर साहब आप अपनी बात करिये। आप सवाल पूछिये।

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN: If he is so ignorant, he should not interrupt me.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: He says that he belongs to a village, but he is not dressed like a villager.

DR. JINENDRA KUMAR JAIN: I do not understand why they are interrupting me. (*Interruptions*) This is a very important supplementary. They want to submerge my voice. May I ask the Government what they have precisely done for the...

श्री शांति त्यागी : आपने खेती की है कभी ? **(व्यवधान)**

डा० जिनेन्द्र कुमार जैन : बहुत सारे ऐसे लोग हैं जिनके पास जमीन नहीं है **(व्यवधान)**

उपसभापति : आप उन्हें सवाल पूछने दीजिये। This is Question Hour. Otherwise, I will pass on to the next question. If you are answering him, I will pass on to the next question. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Jadhav please sit down. I ma not permitting. It is not going on record. Please do not interrupt. It will not go on record. Anything spoken other than the question will not go on record.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: *

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not permitting anybody. This is question Hour. Members give notice and with great difficulty the question comes up. If you are interested in asking a question, I will allow you. I will allow you, but if you want to obstruct other people, this is not the way, this is not in the spirit.

DR. JINANDRA KUMAR JAIN: My question is, on the one hand, the rural poor are being crushed due to the restructuring of the economic policy, on the other, nature is also not kind to them because of drought and floods. I would, therefore, like to know, what are their plans to provide relief to the most oppressed sections of the society?

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, I have already stated that for rural development Rs. 30,000 crores have been provided in the Eighth Five Year Plan. This works out to more than 9.5 per cent of the total Plan outlay as against the **5 per** cent of the Seventh Five Year Plan. This enhanced amount will definitely provide more employment to the rural poor. Also we are now reorienting our programme in such a way that most of the assistance of the Central sectors will go to those areas which are backward and where these poor people, Scheduled Caste, and Scheduled Tribes and these people, predominantly live. We are doing that in the Eight Five Year Plan.

श्री विठ्ठल राव माधवराव जाधव : मैडम डिप्टी चेयरमैन, मैं मंत्री महोदय से यह जानना चाहता हूं आपके माध्यम से कि आखिरी पंचवर्षीय योजना में जो लोग हमारे देश में रूरल एरिया में पावर्टी लाइन के नीचे है, राजीव जी ने उनके लिए जवाहर योजन शुरु की थी... **(व्यवधान)**

श्री प्रमोद महाजन : बिना खेती की... **(व्यवधान)**

उपसभापति : आप इन्टरप्ट मत कीजिए।

श्री विठ्ठल राव माधव राव जाधव : जिन्होंने खेती कभी नहीं देखी वे खेती की बात कर रहे हैं। जवाहर रोजगार योजना जब ग्रामीण क्षेत्र में है तो प्लांटेशन आफ ट्रीज भी आता है एण्ड planation and forestry are also agriculture-based. The hon. Member does not know that.

डा० जिनेन्द्र कुमार जैन : डाक्टरी की है क्या ?

श्री विठ्ठल राव माधवराव जाधव : मैं खुद करता हूं। *Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. (*Interruptions*). Dr. Jain, plea-

*Not recorded.

se sit down. (*Interruptions*). If you do not sit, I will have to reprimand you. (*Interruptions*). I will name you. If Members are going to interrupt like this, I am not going to allow. (*Interruptions*). I am not going to allow you now. Please sit down.

उपसभापति : आप अपना सवाल पूछिए।

श्री विठ्ठलराव माधवराव जाधव : मैं मंत्री महोदय से जानना चाहता हूं कि 8वीं पंचवर्षीय योजना में और बहुत सी योजनाएं शुरू करके ग्रामीण क्षेत्र में रोजगार देने के लिए कितना धन रखा गया है और कितने परसेंटेज रूरल पापूलेशन पावर्टी लाइन के ऊपर आने वाले हैं?

श्री सुख राम : मैडम, अभी जैसे माननीय सदस्य ने कहा तो आठवीं नहीं बल्कि सातवीं पंचवर्षीय योजना में जवाहर रोजगार योजना शुरू हुई है। एन.आर.ई.पी. और आर.एल.ई.जी.पी. को मर्ज करके यह योजना शुरू हुई है। इसमें बेकारी के प्रश्न को हल करने के लिए कोशिश की जा रही है। जैसा मैंने अभी कहा कि जहां सातवीं पंचवर्षीय योजना में करीबन 8 हजार कुछ करोड़ रुपया रूरल, ग्रामीण विकास के लिए रखा था वहां पर अब आठवीं पंचवर्षीय योजना में 30 हजार करोड़ रुपया महज सेंटर का शेयर है, 80 प्रतिशत। आप उससे अंदाज लगा सकते हैं कि 8वीं पंचवर्षीय योजना में कितना रुपया जवाहर रोजगार योजना को मिलेगा और जो दूसरी स्कीमें हैं, योजनाएं हैं पावर्टी एलीमिनेशन प्रोग्राम की, आई.आर.डी.पी. वगैरह की उनको कितना मिलेगा। इससे बहुत राहत इस देश के गरीब लोगों को मिलेगी।

श्री विठ्ठलराव माधव राव जाधव : कितनी परसेंटेज आफ पापूलेशन पावर्टी लाइन के ऊपर आने वाली है... (**व्यवधान**)

श्री सुखराम : मैडम, इस प्रश्न का उत्तर मैं बोल देता हूं कि अभी इंडियन सैम्पुल सर्वे आर्गेनाइजेशन ने 1987-88 तक जो सर्वे किया था उसके जो एस्टीमेट्स हैं वे तो आ गये हैं। करीबन 30 प्रतिशत और एक्जैक्ट 29.9 प्रतिशत है। इस योजना का जो अंत हुआ उसमें करीबन हमारे 25.6 प्रतिशत गरीबी की रेखा के नीचे लोग रहेंगे। उसके लिए हमारा कार्यक्रम है। अभी चूंकि वह सर्वे एस्टीमेट उस ईयर तक का नहीं हुआ इस वास्ते हम यह नहीं कह सकते कि वह लक्ष्य जो हमारा निर्धारित है उसमें हम पहुंच सकें, लेकिन हमारी कोशिश जरूर होगी कि 25.6 प्रतिशत तक उसमें पहुंचे।

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam Deputy Chairman, the Minister has just disclosed how the number of people below the poverty line has fallen. Now I would like to know whether the poverty line itself has fallen and whether they are maintaining a uniform standard. Could the Minister inform the House what is the definition of povertly line, whether it is the same as it was 20 years ago?

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, the Task Force on Minimum Needs and Effective Consumption Demand, in its report submitted in 1979, has defined poverty line. That is, poverty line is the per capita monthly expenditure of Rs. 49.09 in the rural area and Rs. 56.64 in the urban area at 1973-74 prices, corresponding to the per capita calorie reuirement of 2,400 in the rural area and 2,100 in the urban area. That is the poverty line defined by that Task Force. But now, because there have been a number of suggestions, and mostly experts and scholars have been suggesting different methodologies for woriking out the poverty line and the definition of the poverty line, for that the Planning Commission has constituted an expert committee, which is looking into this entire problem. If necessary, the definition of poverty line will also be made by this expert committee and all relevant questions will be looked into by this committee. The last meeting of this committee was held in March 1992, and, I think, shortly the report will be available and then we will come to know what is the poverty line and what is the methodology to be adopted.

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN: Madam, the claim that nearly 30 per cent of the total population are living below the poverty

line has been questioned by academics and other independent organizations. They say that a lot of window-dressing has been done, because according to the World Economic, Survey, 40 per cent of the world's certified poor are living in India. Prof. Minhaus, a former Planning Commission Member, has made a survey and, according to his survey, about 45 per cent of the people are living below the poverty line. According to an independent organization, more than 50 per cent of the people are living below the poverty line. Therefore, I would like to know from the hon. Minister why is the discrepancy. Have you made any window-dressing in the accounts? Otherwise, how could that differ from organization to organization and from academician to academician?

SHRI SUKH RAM: Madam, we are not depending upon the reports of the world organization. We are depending upon our own organization, that is, the Indian Sample Survey Organization which conducts a survey and makes estimates once in an interval of five years. I have already conceded this point that there have been suggestions and a number of scholars and experts have suggested some different methodologies and, for that purpose, a committee of experts has already been constituted and that is looking into this entire problem. If the hon. Member wants to make any suggestion to that committee, we will welcome that also. Your suggestion will also be welcome. ...(*Interruptions*)...

श्री मोहम्मद अलीम : मैडम, गरीबी की सीमा रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों के आंकड़ों को लेकर सरकार काफी खेलती रही है, प्लानिंग कमीशन या बजट में रुपये का आंकड़ा गरीबी की सीमा रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों के लिए बढ़ता गया और उनके नीचे संख्या भी बढ़ती गई है । मैं माननीय मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूं कि नई नीति के आधार पर पिछले एक साल में गरीबी की रेखा के नीचे रहने वाले लोगों की तादाद कितनी संख्या में बढ़ी है, क्या इस बारे में मंत्री महोदय बतायेंगे ?

شری محمد سلیم: میڈم غریبی کی سیما ریکھا کے نیچے رہنے والے لوگوں کے آنکڑوں کو لے کر سرکار کافی کھیلتی رہی ہے۔ پلاننگ کمیشن یا بجٹ میں روپے کا آنکڑا غریبی کی سیما ریکھا کے نیچے رہنے والے لوگوں کے لئے بڑھتا گیا اور ان کے نیچے سنکھیا بھی بڑھتا گیا ہے۔ میں مانیے منتری جی پوچھنا چاہتا ہوں کہ نئی نیتی کے آدھار پر پچھلے ایک سال میں غریبی کی ریکھا کے نیچے رہنے والے لوگوں کی تعداد کتنی سنکھیا میں بڑھی ہے کیا اس بارے میں منتری مہودے بتائیں گے

श्री सुखराम : मैडम, मेरे को शायद माननीय सदस्य ने ठीक ढ़ग से सुना नहीं या समझने की कोशिश नहीं की है ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Question Hour is over. Now Short Notice Question. Shri Inder Kumar Gujaral. ...(*Interruptions*)

This is in continuation of the Question Hour—the Short Notice Question. Shri Inder Kumar Gujaral.

SHORT NOTICE QUESTION NO. 1

Access to Eighth Plan Documents by World Bank

1. SHRI INDER KUMAR GUJARAL:†

SHRI SOMAPPA R. BOMMAI: Will the Minister of PLANNING AND PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION be please to state:

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn to a write-up appearing

†[ ]Translitration in Arabic Script.

†The question was asked on the floor of the House by Shri Inder Kumar Gujaral.